## Case 2:14-cv-04228-JP Document 1 Filed 07/14/14 Page 1 of 11

SJS (Rev. 1202)

## CIVIL COVER SHEET

The IS 44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)

I. (a) PLAINTIFFS	Marina Shikhman	DEFENDANTS			
(b) County of Residence	of First Listed Plaintiff Bucks XCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES)	Experian Trans Union, LLC County of Residence of First Listed Defendant (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY)  NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE LAND INVOLVED.			
Blitshtein & We	Address, and Telephone Number) siss 648 2nd Street Pike PA 18966 215-364-4900	Attorneys (If Known)			
II. BASIS OF JURIST	OICTION (Place as "X" in One Box Only)	III. CITIZENSHIP OF P	PRINCIPAL PARTIES(Place		
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	▼3 Pederal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)		TF DEF 1 1 C 1 Incorporated or Princip of Business In This Sta		
O 2 U.S. Government Defendant	O 4 Diversity     (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)		2 Incorporated and Prins of Business In Anot	ther State	
		Citizen or Subject of a  Foreign Country	13 0 3 Foreign Nation	56 56	
IV. NATURE OF SUI	T (Place an "X" in One Box Only)				
CONTRACT	TORTS	FORFEITURE/PENALITY	BANKRUPTCY	OTHER STATE TES	
110 Insurance     120 Marine     130 Miller Act     140 Negotiable Instrument     150 Recovery of Overpayment     & Enforcement of Judgment	Slander G 368 Asbestos Person	D 620 Other Food & Dang D 625 Drug Related Seizure O 625 Drug Related Seizure O 630 Liquor Laws at D 640 R.R. & Truck	O 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 O PROPERTY RIGHTS O 820 Copyrights	400 State Reapportionment 410 Antimust 430 Banks and Banking 450 Commerce 450 Deportation 470 Racketeer Influenced and	
151 Medicare Act     152 Recovery of Defaulted     Student Loans     (Excl. Veterans)     153 Recovery of Overpayment	O 330 Federal Employers' Injury Product Liability O 340 Marine Product O 370 Other Fraud Lambility O 371 Truth in Lending	☐ 690 Orhei	O 830 Patent O 830 Tradentark O SOCIAL SECURITY	490 Cable/Sat TV 810 Selective Service	
of Veteran's Benefits  160 Stockholders' Suits  190 Other Contract  195 Contract Product Liability  196 Franchise	□ 350 Meter Vehicle □ 380 Other Personal □ 355 Motor Vehicle □ Property Damag □ 360 Other Personal □ 385 Property Damag □ 360 Other Personal □ Product Liability	710 Fair Labor Standards Act 720 Labor/Agent Relations y 3730 Labor/Mgrint Reporting & Disclosure Act	☐ 851 HIA (1395ff) ☐ 862 Black Lung (923) ☐ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) ☐ 864 SSID Title XVI ☐ 865 RSI (405(g))	Exchange  1 875 Customer Challenge 12 USC 3410  X 890 Other Statutory Actions 1 891 Agricultural Acts	
REAL PROPERTY  210 Land Condennation  220 Forcelosure  230 Rent Lesse & Ejechnent  240 Torts to Land	CIVIL RIGHTS PRISONER PETITIO  441 Voting 5 510 Motions to Vacc 5 442 Employment Sentence 443 Housing Habeas Corpus: Accommodations 550 General	nte	26 USC 7609		
D 245 Tort Product Liability D 299 All Other Real Property	O 444 Welfate O 335 Death Penalty 445 Amer. wtDisabilities O 540 Mandanus & O Employment O 550 Civil Rights Othe: O 555 Prison Condition Other	17 463 Habeas Corpus .	on .	Under Equal Access to Justice  950 Constitutionality of State Statutes	
Ox Original D 2 F	State Court Appellate Court	Reopened anoth	insferred from the district cife (in the district cife)	Appeal to District Judge from Magistrate Judgment	
VI. CAUSE OF ACT	ION Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you 15 U.S.C. Section1681 et see Brief description of cause: Fair Credit Reporting Act	are filing (Do not cite jurisdiction	nal statutes unless diversity):		
VII. REQUESTED I COMPLAINT:	The state of the s	ON DEMANDS	CHECK YES only if JURY DEMAND:	demanded in complaint	
VIII. RELATED CA IF ANY	(See instructions): JUDGE		DOCKET NUMBER		
7/11/20	SIGNATURE OF (	ALDERY OF RECORD	A State of the Paris of the Annual Control of the C		
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY	the first consistence of the second s	AVII.			

## Case 2:14-cv-04228-JP Document 1 Filed 07/14/14 Page 2 of 11

## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

dress of Plaintiffs 3413 Manor Rd, Huntingdon Valley, PA 190	100					
Address of Defendant: Trans Union 1510 Chester Pike CrumLynne, PA 19022, Experian 5 Century Drive Parsippin/N						
see of Accident, Incident or Transaction: (Use Reverse Side For.)	additional Space)					
tos this civil action involve a nongovernmental corporate party with any parent corporation						
Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statement Form in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 7-1(a						
oos this case involve multidistrict intigation possibilities?	Yes□ No 😡					
SLATED CASE, IF ANY:  Indge  Judge	Date Terrainated					
Aloge .	Date (chamated)					
vil cases are deemed related when yes is answered to any of the following questions:						
Is this case related to property included in an earlier numbered suit pending or within one y	year proviously terminated action in this court?					
	YesD No X					
Does this case involve the same issue of fact or grow out of the same transaction as a prior action in this court?						
	Yes□ No□					
Does this ease involve the validity or infringement of a patent already in suit or any earlier						
terminated action in this court?	Ycs□ No.□					
Is this case a second or successive habeas corous, social security appeal, or pro se civil rigi	hts case filed by the same individual?					
	Yes□ No⊠					
VIL: (Place V in ONE CATEGORY ONLY)						
Federal Question Cases:	B. Diversity Jurisdiction Coses:					
D Indemnity Contract, Marine Contract, and All Other Contracts	1.   Insurance Contract and Other Contracts					
D FELA	2. □ Airplane Personal Injury					
. D Jones Act-Personal Injury	3. ☐ Assault, Defamation					
, 🖸 Antitrust	4. ☐ Marine Personal Injury					
, 🖸 Patent	5.   Motor Vehicle Personal Injury					
D Labor-Management Relations	6. □ Other Personal Injury (Please					
	specify)					
, D Civil Rights	7. □ Products Liability					
. □ Habeas Corpus	8.  Products Liability — Asbestos					
. G Securities Act(s) Cases	9. □ All other Diversity Cases					
0. D Social Security Review Cases	(Please specify)					
1. ☑ All other Federal Question Cases FDCPA (Please specify)						
ARBITRATION CER (Check Appropriate						
Tova Weiss counsel of record do hereby cor						
☐ Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Section 3(c)(2), that to the best of my knowledge at 150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs:	nd belief, the damages recoverable in this civil action case exceed the sum of					
© Relief other than monetary damages is sought.						
-: 7/11/2 MM 119	74015					
DATE: 111 CO19						
NOTE: A trial de novo will be a trial by jury only if	Attorney I.D.# there has been compliance with F.R.C.P. 38.					
certify that, to my knowledge, the within case is not related to any case now pending	or within one year previously terminated action in this court					
except as noted above;	A. C.					
7/4/2014 July	74015					
DATE:						

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

#### CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

	CIVIL ACTION
Marina Shikhman	
v.	
Trans Union, LLC and	NO.
Experian Experian	

In accordance with the Civil Justice Expense and Delay Reduction Plan of this court, counsel for plaintiff shall complete a Case Management Track Designation Form in all civil cases at the time of filing the complaint and serve a copy on all defendants. (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the reverse side of this form.) In the event that a defendant does not agree with the plaintiff regarding said designation, that defendant shall, with its first appearance, submit to the clerk of court and serve on the plaintiff and all other parties, a Case Management Track Designation Form specifying the track to which that defendant believes the case should be assigned.

#### SELECT ONE OF THE FOLLOWING CASE MANAGEMENT TRACKS:

(a) Habeas Corpus - Ca	1 through § 2255.	(	)		
(b) Social Security – Cases requesting review of a decision of the Secretary of Health and Human Services denying plaintiff Social Security Benefits.					
<ul> <li>c) Arbitration – Cases required to be designated for arbitration under Local Civil Rule 53.2.</li> <li>d) Asbestos – Cases involving claims for personal injury or property damage from exposure to asbestos.</li> </ul>					
(f) Standard Management - Cases that do not fall into any one of the other tracks.					
7/11/2014 Date	Tova Weiss	Marina Shikhman			
Date _215-364-4900	Attorney-at-law 215-364-8050	Attorney for Plaintiff weiss@lawyersbw.com			
Telephone	FAX Number	E-Mail Address		- 1	

(Civ. 660) 18/02

# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

MARINA SHIKHMAN

3413 Manor Road

Huntingdon Valley, PA 19006

No.:

Plaintiff

Jury Trial Demanded

100

**EXPERIAN INFORMATION** 

٧.

SOLUTIONS, INC.

5 Century Drive

Parsippany, NJ 07054

.

and

TRANS UNION, LLC

1510 Chester Pike

Crum Lynne, PA 19022

.

Defendants

#### COMPLAINT

#### INTRODUCTION

This is a lawsuit for damages brought by an individual consumer for
 Defendant(s)' alleged violations of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. 1681, et seq.
 (hereinafter "FCRA") .

### JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 1 .
  - All previous paragraphs of this complaint are incorporated by reference and made a part of this complaint.
  - Jurisdiction of this Court arises pursuant to 15 U.S.C. Section 1681p and 28 U.S.C.
     Section 1331.
    - 4. Venue lies in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 1391(b).
  - Defendant obtains the benefit(s) of regularly transacting business in
     Montgomery County, PA and of regularly transacting business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

#### **PARTIES**

- 6. All previous paragraphs of this complaint are incorporated by reference and made a part of this Complaint.
- Plaintiff is Marina Shikhman, an adult individual with a current address of 3413
   Manor Road, Huntingdon Valley, PA 19006.
- 8. Defendant(s) is Experian Information Solutions, Inc. (hereafter"EX ") a business organization that regularly conducts business in the Eastern District of Pennsylvania and with a principle place of business located at 5 Century Drive, Parsippany, NJ 07054.
- 9. Defendant(s) is Trans Union, LLC, (hereafter"TU ") a business organization that regularly conducts business in the Eastern District of Pennsylvania and with a principle place of business located at 1510 Chester Pike, Crum Lynne, PA 19022.

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 10. All previous paragraphs of this complaint are incorporated by reference and made a part of this Complaint.
- 11. Defendant(s) has/have been reporting derogatory and inaccurate information about Plaintiff and Plaintiff's credit history to third parties from on or about February 2009 to the present.
- 12. The inaccurate information includes, but is not limited to, late payments on the EX and TU credit reports from February 2009 through March 2010 on EX and through April 2010 on TU.
- 13. The inaccurate information includes, but is not limited to, a mark of

  FORECLOSURE and late payments on both the EX and TU credit reports. (See attached Experian and Trans Union credit reports, Exhibit "A.")
- 14. The inaccurate information negatively reflects upon the Plaintiff, Plaintiff's credit history and Plaintiff's financial responsibility as a debtor and Plaintiff's credit worthiness. Due to the Defendant's faulty procedures, Defendants failed to correct and/or remove the derogatory information from Plaintiff's credit reports.
- 15. The Defendant(s) has/have been reporting the inaccurate information through the issuance of false and inaccurate credit information and consumer credit reports that they have disseminated to various credit grantors and persons, both known and unknown from at least 2010 through the present.

- 16. Plaintiff has disputed the inaccurate information to EX and TU, since as far back as 2010 and subsequently on three (3) separate occasions, by following their established procedures for disputing consumer credit information. (See attached Plaintiff's letters and EX and TU responses, Exhibit "B.")
- 17. Upon information and belief, EX and TU received notice of Plaintiff's dispute and per their duties under the FCRA, Defendant(s) purportedly investigated Plaintiff's disputes.
- 18. Despite Plaintiff's efforts, Defendant(s) has/have never: (1) contacted Plaintiff to follow up on, verify and/or elicit more specific information about Plaintiff's disputes; (2) contacted any third parties that would have relevant information concerning Plaintiff's disputes; (3) forwarded any relevant information concerning Plaintiff's disputes to the entities originally furnishing the inaccurate information; (4) requested or obtained any credit applications, or other relevant documents from the entities furnishing the inaccurate information.
- 19. Despite Plaintiff's dispute, Defendant(s) has/have nonetheless deliberately, willfully, intentionally, recklessly and negligently failed to perform reasonable investigations and/or reinvestigations of the above disputes as required by the FCRA, have failed to remove the inaccurate/derogatory information, have failed to provide the method of verification, have failed to report on the results of said investigation and/or reinvestigations to all credit reporting agencies and have continued to cause the reporting of the derogatory inaccurate information about Plaintiff.

- 20. By letter dated February 20, 2014, Plaintiff notified Defendants, in writing, of the case of CitiMortgage, Inc. v. Marina Shikhman, *et al.*, wherein a Notice of Voluntary Dismissal was filed by CitiMortgage with the Circuit Court of the Eleventh Judicial Circuit in and for Miami Dade County, Florida, voluntarily dismissing Plaintiff from the case. This Voluntary Dismissal was filed on or about July 6, 2010, yet Defendants failed to conduct an investigation and/or reinvestigations, failed to report on the results of said investigation and/or reinvestigations, failed to remove the inaccurate/derogatory information and have continued to cause derogatory inaccurate information about Plaintiff. (See attached Notice of Voluntary Dismissal, Exhibit "C.")
- 21. Plaintiff's credit reports and file have been obtained from Defendant(s) and have been received by prospective and existing credit grantors and extenders of credit and the inaccurate information has been a substantial factor in precluding Plaintiff from receiving credit offers and opportunities, known and unknown from at least February 2009 through the present.
- 22. As a result of Defendant's willful and negligent non-compliance with the FCRA, Plaintiff suffered actual damages due to credit denial of loss of credit opportunity, credit defamation, emotional distress, anxiety, embarrassment and humiliation.
- 23. At all times material hereto, Defendant was acting by and through its agents, servants and/or employees who were acting within the course and scope of their employment/agency and under the supervision and control of the Defendant.

24. At all times material hereto, the conduct of the Defendant and its agent, servants and/or employees was intentional, willful, reckless and grossly negligent disregard for federal and state consumer laws of the Plaintiff.

#### **COUNT I- Violations of the FCRA**

- 25. All previous paragraphs of this complaint are incorporated by reference and made a part of this Complaint.
- 26. At all times material hereto, Plaintiff, Marina Shikhman, was a "person" and a "consumer reporting agency" in accordance with 15 U.S.C. Section 1681a(b) and (f).
- 27. At all times material hereto, Plaintiff was a "consumer" in accordance with 15U.S.C. Section 181a(c).
- 28. At all times material hereto, the credit reports mentioned in this Complaint were "consumer reports" in accordance with 15 U.S.C. Section 1681a(d).
- 29. Pursuant to 15 U.S. C section 1681n Defendants EQ, EX and TU are liable to Plaintiff for willful noncompliance of the requirements on consumer reporting agencies pursuant to 15 U.S.C. Section 1681e(b) and for continuing to report information that is inaccurate, incomplete or cannot be verified in violation of 15 U.S.C. Section 1681i(a)(5)(A) and 1681i(a)(5)(A)(i).
- 30. Pursuant to 15 U.S. C section 1681o Defendants EQ, EX and TU are liable to Plaintiff for negligent noncompliance of the requirements on consumer reporting agencies pursuant to 15 U.S.C. Section 1681e(b) and for continuing to report information that is

inaccurate, incomplete or cannot be verified in violation of 15 U.S.C. Section 1681i(a)(5)(A) and 1681i(a)(5)(A)(i).

- 31. Defendant is liable for the acts of its employees/agents per the doctrine of respondeat superior as Defendant's employee(s)/agent(s) were acting with the scope of their employment with Defendant.
- 32. Any mistake made by Defendant is a mistake of law and not a reasonable or bona fide mistake.
- 33. Defendant is liable to Plaintiff for statutory, actual and punitive damages and attorney's fees, costs of litigation and all other relief per law.

#### JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

34. Plaintiff requests trial by jury for all triable issues in this case.

#### **DAMAGES**

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff seeks judgment in its favor and damages against the Defendant as follows:

- a. Statutory Damages;
- b. Actual Damages;
- c. Punitive Damages;
- d. Costs and attorney's fees pursuant to 15 U.S.C. Section 1681n and 1681o;
- e. All other relief that the Court deems just and proper.

Date: 7/11/2014

Respectfully Submitted, BLITSHTEIN & WEISS, P.C.

Ву:

Southampton, PA 18966 648 2nd Street Pike Iriana Blitshtein, Esquire Tova Weiss, Esquire

Fax (215)364-8050

(215)364-4900

Attorneys for Plaintiff